

# CASE STUDY

## Downside Protection During Market Drawdowns

March 2020

### AUTHORS

**Devang Gambhirwala**  
Principal and Portfolio Manager

**Stephen Brundage, CFA**  
Managing Director and Head of  
Product and Affiliate Relations

### ABOUT QMA

QMA began managing multi-asset portfolios for institutional investors in 1975. Today, we manage both systematic quantitative equity and global multi-asset strategies as part of PGIM, the global investment management businesses of Prudential Financial, Inc. (PFI). Our investment processes, based on academic, economic and behavioral foundations, serve a global client base with \$127.2 billion in assets under management as of 12/31/2019.

### FOR MORE INFORMATION

To learn more about our MPS strategy, please contact QMA in the US at +1 (866) 748-0643 or in the UK at +44 (0) 20-7663-3400.

Given recent market volatility, there has been a greater focus on analyzing the tradeoff between upside growth in equities and downside protection in defensive equity strategies. QMA's US Market Participation Strategy (MPS) was designed in 1992 to participate in about 65% of the market upside with only about 30% of the downside of the S&P 500 Index. This combination of reduced maximum drawdown with significant upside capture has provided annualized returns in line with the S&P 500 Index over the long term—but with significantly less volatility. This strategy is guided by our portfolio management team's almost 30 years of experience<sup>1</sup> in designing and managing MPS (inception date 1/1/1992).

In our study, we compare various defensive equity strategies to QMA's MPS, which combines S&P 500 Index call options and US Treasuries. We find that MPS not only compares well with, or outperforms, most of the other defensive strategies, but it does so consistently during significant equity market drawdowns.

<sup>1</sup> As of 3/20/2020.



**Past performance is not a guarantee or a reliable indicator of future results.  
For Professional Investors only.  
All investments involve risk, including the potential loss of capital.**

## QMA US Market Participation Strategy (MPS)

QMA's US Market Participation Strategy (MPS) seeks to provide upside participation when the US equity market advances, while reducing downside risk.<sup>2</sup> The strategy utilizes long-dated S&P 500 call options in combination with US Treasuries. Call options seek to provide upside participation with downside protection, while US Treasuries serve as a safe haven during turbulent market conditions. Using a disciplined process, exposures (market, volatility and duration) are actively managed in response to the changing market environment.

## Coronavirus Crisis/Market Drawdown

As the Coronavirus (COVID-19) crisis spreads worldwide, with cases growing exponentially, and we look at "lockdowns" across many parts of the world, global equity markets have swooned. Markets remain extremely volatile as investors try to comprehend the financial impact to the global economy going forward.

Having entered an equity bear market in the US, we looked at the performance of MPS and comparable defensive strategies over the past month (Feb 20th to March 20th), to see if any of these strategies have indeed provided any measure of downside protection. As the table below shows, MPS has performed well compared to a range of popular defensive strategies.<sup>3</sup> We compared MPS against BXM (buy-write or covered call writing), PPUT (protective put), a 60/40 Balanced Portfolio (60% S&P 500 Index, 40% Bloomberg Barclays US Aggregate Bond Index.), SP5LVIT (S&P 500 Low Volatility Index) and VXAO (ICE BofA Merrill Lynch All US Convertibles Index). We also show the S&P 500 Total Return Index (SPTR) as a proxy/benchmark for the US equities market.

### Coronavirus Crisis (2/20/2020 – 3/20/2020):

MPS* (Gross)	MPS* (Net)	BXM	PPUT	60/40	SP5LVIT	VXAO	SPTR
-10.6%	-10.7%	-29.1%	-10.0%	-19.9%	-32.4%	-26.1%	-31.8%

\*Preliminary US MPS Composite returns.

Source: QMA, Bloomberg, FactSet and Markit.

Past performance is not a guarantee or reliable indicator of future results.

## Past Drawdowns

While MPS has performed as expected so far during the Coronavirus crisis, we thought it would be interesting to see how it performed during past crises. Since MPS has a long track record (almost 30 years), and we've been in a bull market for most of this period, two crises are most relevant: the Global Financial Crisis (2007-2009) and the Tech Bubble Burst (2000-2002).

Again, throughout both time periods, MPS delivered on its objective of reducing downside risk and limiting significant drawdowns:

### Global Financial Crisis (11/1/2007 – 2/28/2009; monthly data):

MPS* (Gross)	MPS* (Net)	BXM	PPUT	60/40	SP5LVIT	VXAO	SPTR
-10.0%	-10.4%	-35.8%	-38.2%	-32.5%	-33.5%	-40.5%	-50.9%

\*US MPS Composite returns. Source: QMA, Bloomberg, FactSet and Markit.

Past performance is not a guarantee or reliable indicator of future results.

### Tech Bubble Burst (9/1/2000 – 9/30/2002; monthly data):

MPS* (Gross)	MPS* (Net)	BXM	PPUT	60/40	SP5LVIT	VXAO	SPTR
-17.0%	-17.5%	-30.2%	-32.3%	-22.8%	9.0%	-31.8%	-44.7%

\*US MPS Composite returns. Source: QMA, Bloomberg, FactSet and Markit.

Past performance is not a guarantee or reliable indicator of future results.

<sup>2</sup> There is no guarantee that this objective will be achieved.

<sup>3</sup> Detailed descriptions for each strategy are listed in the Appendix.

## Long-Term Performance

While it is interesting to look at performance in down markets, it is also useful for the sake of completeness to evaluate the totality of performance of these strategies—not only in “bad times,” but throughout time (in both up and down markets).

The table below lists key performance and risk statistics for all of the strategies mentioned above.

### Long-Term Periodic Performance (Annualized) as of 2/29/2020:

	MPS* (Gross)	MPS* (Net)	BXM	PPUT	60/40	SP5LVIT	VXAO	SPTR
<b>5 year</b>								
Return	5.5%	5.2%	4.8%	7.4%	7.2%	9.9%	7.7%	9.2%
Std Dev	7.8%	7.8%	8.3%	10.3%	7.5%	10.4%	8.8%	12.6%
Sharpe Ratio	0.56	0.52	0.45	0.60	0.81	0.84	0.75	0.64
Max Drawdown	-9.1%	-9.1%	-10.8%	-10.5%	-7.6%	-9.5%	-14.2%	-13.5%
Sortino Ratio	0.79	0.72	0.39	0.88	1.08	1.04	0.97	0.80
<b>15 year</b>								
Return	6.8%	6.5%	4.8%	6.2%	7.1%	9.5%	7.7%	8.4%
Std Dev	7.2%	7.2%	10.3%	10.9%	8.5%	10.5%	11.4%	14.1%
Sharpe Ratio	0.75	0.70	0.34	0.44	0.67	0.78	0.55	0.50
Max Drawdown	-11.7%	-12.2%	-35.8%	-38.9%	-32.5%	-35.4%	-42.1%	-50.9%
Sortino Ratio	1.19	1.12	0.33	0.62	0.80	0.91	0.60	0.61
<b>25 year</b>								
Return	8.5%	8.1%	7.2%	6.7%	8.2%	11.0%	8.8%	9.6%
Std Dev	8.9%	8.9%	10.6%	11.7%	8.9%	11.2%	12.0%	14.7%
Sharpe Ratio	0.67	0.64	0.45	0.36	0.65	0.75	0.53	0.48
Max Drawdown	-19.0%	-19.5%	-35.8%	-38.9%	-32.5%	-35.4%	-42.1%	-50.9%
Sortino Ratio	1.04	0.98	0.46	0.54	0.87	0.98	0.63	0.64

\*US MPS Composite returns.

Source: QMA, Bloomberg, FactSet and Markit.

As the table shows, MPS provides consistent risk-adjusted returns annualized over time, while reducing risk and limiting drawdowns over each period considered (5, 15 and 25 years). Some of the other strategies have outperformed at times during the periods shown above, but MPS has the lowest volatility and the best drawdown performance.

No investment strategy or risk management technique can guarantee returns or eliminate risk in any market environment.

## Appendix

### **BXM – CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index**

The CBOE S&P 500 BuyWrite Index (BXM) is a benchmark index designed to track the performance of a hypothetical buy-write strategy on the S&P 500 Index.

The BXM is a passive total return index based on (1) buying an S&P 500 stock index portfolio, and (2) “writing” (or selling) the near-term S&P 500 Index “covered” call option, generally on the third Friday of each month. The SPX call written will have about one month remaining to expiration, with an exercise price just above the prevailing index level (i.e., slightly out of the money). The SPX call is held until expiration and cash settlement, at which time a new one-month, near-the-money call is written.

We consider the BXM a passive proxy and benchmark for a covered call strategy.

### **PPUT – CBOE S&P 500 5% Put Protection Index**

The CBOE S&P 500 5% Put Protection Index is designed to track the performance of a hypothetical strategy that holds a long position indexed to the S&P 500 Index and buys a monthly 5% out-of-the-money S&P 500 Index (SPX) put option as a hedge. The PPUT Index rolls on a monthly basis, typically every third Friday of the month.

### **60/40 Balanced Portfolio (60% S&P 500 Index, 40% Bloomberg Barclays US Aggregate Bond Index)**

This portfolio return is calculated monthly by adding 60% of the S&P 500 Index Total Return and 40% of the Bloomberg Barclays US Aggregate Bond Index return.

### **SP5LVIT – S&P 500 Low Volatility Index**

The S&P 500 Low Volatility Index measures the performance of the 100 least volatile stocks in the S&P 500 Index. The index benchmarks low volatility or low variance strategies for the US stock market. Constituents are weighted relative to the inverse of their corresponding volatility, with the least volatile stocks receiving the highest weights.

### **VXAO – ICE BofA Merrill Lynch All US Convertible Index**

The ICE Bank of America Merrill Lynch All US Convertibles Index is an unmanaged index that consists of convertible bonds traded in US-dollar denominated investment grade and non-investment grade convertible securities sold into the US market and publicly traded in the United States. The index constituents are market value-weighted based on the convertible securities prices and outstanding shares, and the underlying index is rebalanced daily. Convertibles offer the potential to participate in equity markets, while still providing bond-like defensive features in turbulent markets.

### **SPTR – S&P 500 Total Return Index**

The S&P 500 Index is an unmanaged index that is widely regarded as the standard for measuring large-cap US stock market performance. The total return includes the price return plus dividends reinvested in the index.



## Notes to Disclosure

**For Professional Investors only. All investments involve risk, including the possible loss of capital. Past performance is not a guarantee or a reliable indicator of future results. Diversification does not assure a profit or protect against loss in declining markets.**

These materials represent the views, opinions and recommendations of the author(s) regarding economic conditions, asset classes, and strategies. Distribution of this information to any person other than the person to whom it was originally delivered is unauthorized, and any reproduction of these materials, in whole or in part, or the divulgence of any of the contents hereof, without prior consent of QMA LLC (QMA) is prohibited. Certain information contained herein has been obtained from sources that QMA believes to be reliable as of the date presented; however, QMA cannot guarantee the accuracy of such information, assure its completeness, or warrant that such information will not be changed. These materials are not intended as an offer or solicitation with respect to the purchase or sale of any security or other financial instrument or any investment management services and should not be used as the basis for any investment decision. No liability whatsoever is accepted for any loss (whether direct, indirect, or consequential) that may arise from any use of the information contained in or derived from this report. QMA and its affiliates may make investment decisions that are inconsistent with the views expressed herein, including for proprietary accounts of QMA or its affiliates.

These materials are for informational and educational purposes. In providing these materials, QMA is not acting as your fiduciary.

In Europe, certain regulated activities are carried out by representatives of PGIM Limited, which is authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority (Registration Number 193418), and duly passported in various jurisdictions in the European Economic Area. QMA LLC, which is an affiliate to PGIM Limited, is an SEC-registered investment adviser, and a limited liability company. PGIM Limited's Registered Office, Grand Buildings, 1-3 Strand, Trafalgar Square, London WC2N 5HR.

These materials are issued by PGIM Limited to persons who are professional clients or eligible counterparties as defined in Directive 2014/65/EU (MiFID II), investing for their own account, for fund of funds, or discretionary clients. No liability whatsoever is accepted for any loss (whether direct, indirect or consequential) that may arise from any use of the information contained in or derived from this report.

QMA is a wholly-owned subsidiary of PGIM, Inc., the principal asset management business of PFI of the United States of America. PFI of the United States is not affiliated in any manner with Prudential plc, incorporated in the United Kingdom or with Prudential Assurance Company, a subsidiary of M&G plc, incorporated in the United Kingdom.

In Japan, investment management services are made available by PGIM Japan, Co. Ltd., ("PGIM Japan"), a registered Financial Instruments Business Operator with the Financial Services Agency of Japan. In Hong Kong, information is presented by PGIM (Hong Kong) Limited, a regulated entity with the Securities and Futures Commission in Hong Kong to professional investors as defined in Part 1 of Schedule 1 of the Securities and Futures Ordinance. In Singapore, information is issued by PGIM (Singapore) Pte. Ltd. ("PGIM Singapore"), a Singapore investment manager that is licensed as a capital markets service license holder by the Monetary Authority of Singapore and an exempt financial adviser. These materials are issued by PGIM Singapore for the general information of "institutional investors" pursuant to Section 304 of the Securities and Futures Act, Chapter 289 of Singapore (the "SFA") and "accredited investors" and other relevant persons in accordance with the conditions specified in Sections 305 of the SFA. In South Korea, information is issued by QMA, which is licensed to provide discretionary investment management services directly to South Korean qualified institutional investors.

BLOOMBERG® is a trademark and service mark of Bloomberg Finance L.P. and its affiliates (collectively "Bloomberg"). BARCLAYS® is a trademark and service mark of Barclays Bank Plc (collectively with its affiliates, "Barclays"), used under license. Bloomberg or Bloomberg's licensors, including Barclays, own all proprietary rights in the Bloomberg Barclays Indices. Neither Bloomberg nor Barclays approves or endorses this material, or guarantees the accuracy or completeness of any information herein, or makes any warranty, express or implied, as to the results to be obtained therefrom and, to the maximum extent allowed by law, neither shall have any liability or responsibility for injury or damages arising in connection therewith.

Performance results are stated gross and net of model fees. QMA's highest advisory fee in effect for each period is the model fee used to calculate net of fee performance. The fee used to calculate the net returns is .30%. Performance has been calculated in US dollars and reflects the reinvestments of dividends and other earnings. Returns for each client will be reduced by such fees and expenses as described in their individual contract.

Actual advisory fees charged and actual account minimum size may vary by account. Net returns are calculated by deducting the highest tier of the QMA fee schedule in effect for the respective time period from the monthly gross composite return. The annualized return is equivalent to the annual return which, if earned in each year of the indicated multi-year period, would produce the actual cumulative return over the time period. Past performance is not a guarantee of future results.

The opinions expressed herein do not take into account individual client circumstances, objectives, or needs and are therefore are not intended to serve as investment recommendations. No determination has been made regarding the suitability of particular strategies to particular clients or prospects. The financial indices referenced herein is provided for informational purposes only. Financial indices assume reinvestment of dividends but do not reflect the impact of fees, applicable taxes or trading costs which may also reduce the returns shown. The statistical data regarding such indices has been obtained from sources believed to be reliable but has not been independently verified. You cannot invest directly in an index.

Certain information contained herein may constitute "forward-looking statements," (including observations about markets and industry and regulatory trends as of the original date of this document). Due to various risks and uncertainties, actual events or results may differ materially from those reflected or contemplated in such forward-looking statements. As a result, you should not rely on such forward-looking statements in making any decisions. No representation or warranty is made as to future performance or such forward-looking statements.

PGIM, QMA, the QMA logo and the Rock design are service marks of PFI and its related entities, registered in many jurisdictions worldwide.

QMA- 20200326-130